*The Tudor Dynasty: Contested Legitimacy in Renaissance England*

Luke Pepin

HIST 1100W: The Historian as Detective

May 10, 2025

From May 22, 1455, to June 16, 1487, the Wars of the Roses engulfed England as traditional principles of succession to the English Throne were thrown out the window in favor of political action and strategic military victories. This chaotic time allowed the relatively obscure and previously inconsequential House of Tudor to rise to power. Over the span of five monarchs and the next 118 years, the Tudor dynasty made dramatic reforms to England's religious, political, and social landscape. This paper argues that each monarch of the Tudor dynasty faced struggles with legitimacy which profoundly influenced their policies and respective reigns. From Henry VII's tumultuous establishment to Elizabeth I's choice to remain unmarried, the Tudors' legacy is defined by legitimacy crises, resulting in the dynasty's conclusion after only five monarchs.

Henry VII had the clearest and most obvious concerns about legitimacy at the forefront of his reign. Henry Tudor's claim to the throne depended on descent through the female line and the controversial Beaufort branch, which had been specifically barred from succession despite being legitimized. However, during the Wars of the Roses, 3 kings were executed by their rivals, and the nature of royal succession in England was fundamentally changed claims of bloodlines were now viewed as much less impactful than military victories.[[1]](#footnote-12343) For Henry, his victory came at the Battle of Bosworth with "the decisive defeat of the stronger army. Its leader, the King [Richard III], had been killed fighting heroically... But in the victor's army all was rejoicing... they hailed him joyously as their sovereign."[[2]](#footnote-28209) Coming from the most unstable chapter of the English Throne, Henry VII recognized his insecurity and immediately implemented policies designed to secure his authority. His strategic marriage to Elizabeth of York aimed to unite the houses, while his insistence on being crowned before the wedding worked to establish his independent right to rule rather than appearing to gain the throne through marriage.[[3]](#footnote-11469) Henry's establishment of the Tudor rose symbol, combining the white rose of York with the red rose of Lancaster, served as powerful visual propaganda of his unification claim. His cautious foreign policy, avoiding costly wars while securing recognition through strategic treaties with Scotland and France, further stabilized his tenuous position. Henry systematically eliminated potential rivals, including the young Earl of Warwick, while heavily rewarding members of his court who had shown loyalty. His establishment of the Court of Star Chamber enhanced royal judicial authority, while his frugality built a treasury that reduced his reliance on Parliament.[[4]](#footnote-900) Each policy and action Henry VII took as ruler aimed to reinforce his position, setting the tone for each of the other rulers in the Tudor dynasty.

Henry VIII inherited his father's throne and legitimacy concerns but confronted them with much less tactical finesse, instead pursuing unprecedented religious transformations. With no military victories, Henry VIII obtained the throne as was common before the Wars of the Roses through succession. This inheritance left him the throne but also the precarious bloodline claim of his father as well as vulnerabilities from challengers with stronger hereditary claims or greater martial reputations.[[5]](#footnote-26101) From these legitimacy anxieties led to Henry's obsession with a male heir. With a male heir, the line of succession would be clear and concise, preventing any challengers and further cementing the Tudor dynasty. Early in his reign "was the only period of the reign during which a coherent body of policies was purposefully carried through,"[[6]](#footnote-82) policies centered on resolving the succession crisis. His desire to annul his marriage to Catherine of Aragon resulted in the break with Rome, as documented in the Calendar of State Papers from January 1532: "The Consistory to-day lasted nearly until the 22nd hour, in discussing the English marriage suit... The imperial ambassadors, who are acting for the queen, keep demanding a sentence, and ask for justice. The English, assisted by the French, asked for delay..."[[7]](#footnote-30428) Declaring himself the Supreme Head of the Church of England, Henry solved his marital problem and expanded his royal authority. As the head of the church, Henry's new policies, such as the dissolution of monasteries, served both economic and political purposes. By seizing church funds, Henry funded large-scale displays of wealth and power to overawe potential challengers, while simultaneously eliminating institutional centers that might support opposition. His expanded definition of treason, making even verbal criticism of the king punishable by death, further protected his position. These measures created a governmental system where "Henry was happy to base all government decisions around one belief. God had placed Henry as king in that position. Therefore, everyone had to conform to what Henry wanted because if they did not, they were not only defying God's lieutenant on Earth, but also God himself."[[8]](#footnote-12705) Despite all these efforts, continued resistance to the Tudor monarchs persisted, such as with the Irish uprising of 1534, demonstrating the still precarious position of the dynasty.

Before his death, Henry VIII made elaborate legal arrangements to determine succession to the throne. The fact that it was necessary to create such elaborate arrangements is reason enough to highlight the fragility of the House of Tudor. However, it is even more damning given the actual results of succession which followed. At 9 years old, Edward VI became the 3rd Tudor monarch. Though Edward's reign was brief, his Protestant reforms deeply entrenched religious division that would plague subsequent Tudor monarchs. His 'Devise for the Succession,' attempting to bypass both his sisters in favor of Lady Jane Grey, demonstrated how inheritance ambiguity continued to undermine Tudor stability despite Henry VIII's legal provisions.[[9]](#footnote-8829) The Third Succession Act proved ineffective when confronted with Mary's superior military position and popular support, highlighting the truth of the Wars of the Roses that military position triumphs over a traditional claim backed by precedence. Mary I's successful challenge to Jane Grey's nine-day reign reinforced the primacy of force in determining royal legitimacy.[[10]](#footnote-2182) Upon securing the throne, Mary immediately pursued policies designed to reinforce her position through religious reformation and international alliance. As one historian notes, "In September 1553, even before her coronation she replaced Protestant bishops with Catholic ones,"[[11]](#footnote-23370) signaling her intent to secure legitimacy through religious orthodoxy. Parliament supported her authority and agenda by passing an Act of Repeal that voided Edwardian reforms, reinstating clerical celibacy and ritual worship while solidifying power through the systematic prosecution of Protestant dissenters, with over 300 people executed during her reign. These executions not only silenced religious opposition but also demonstrated the punishment for challenges against royal authority.[[12]](#footnote-23609) Mary's marriage to Philip II of Spain represented another legitimacy strategy, designed to secure international recognition and Catholic support. Despite parliamentary protests, Mary asserted: "My marriage is my own affair,"[[13]](#footnote-10426) strengthening England with a foreign power rather than supporting the Tudor dynasty. However, this marriage failed to produce an heir, once again leaving the Tudor house with more legitimacy and political challenges.

The reign of Elizabeth I represented the culmination of all the Tudor legitimacy challenges and finally its end. Through calculated ambiguity regarding succession, cultivation of a royal mythology, and her abnormally long reign, she was able to address many challenges at the expense of an heir. Elizabeth's refusal to marry ensured her authority remained unchallenged by a husband, avoiding the struggles previously held by her father and sister. This stemmed from royal marriages, and specifically Tudor marriages, often having competing claims to power within the royal couple; refusing to marry solved this problem altogether. During her reign, much like every other Tudor monarch, other challengers arose with claims to the throne. Most significant of Elizabeth's challengers was Mary Queen of Scots, whose execution in 1587 showed once again the constant Tudor legitimacy problems which at that point had plagued the House for a century.[[14]](#footnote-26312) The Spanish Armada's defeat in 1588 transformed Elizabeth's image from questionable female ruler to national symbol, temporarily obscuring legitimacy concerns through military triumph. Her strategic use of royal portraiture and public appearances maintained the illusion of perpetual strength even as the succession question remained deliberately unresolved. Her politics reflected a much more moderate break and stability that the other monarchs of the house often missed. Elizabeth's religious policies established a Protestant Church of England that compromised to mitigate religious division. Unlike her predecessors, Elizabeth developed a cult of personality to maintain her perception, resulting in the name "Gloriana,"[[15]](#footnote-26352) which associated her as a powerful ruler who safeguarded Protestant England.⁸ Her famous declaration of being "married to England" transformed a legitimacy weakness into a political strength, presenting her childlessness as dedication to the nation rather than a dynastic failure.[[16]](#footnote-11054) Due to all these innovations, Elizabeth held the throne as the longest and last of the Tudor monarchs.

After Elizabeth's death in 1603, the peaceful transition to James VI of Scotland, while preventing another succession war, highlighted the ultimate failure of the Tudor dynasty. This transition proved the final loss in the Tudors' ongoing battle with legitimacy concerns, ending their rule.

The Tudor dynasty, emerging from a transformed England that allowed them to come to power, was defined by legitimacy crises. Each monarch sought in their own ways to address their tenuous claims. From Henry VII's administrative innovations, Henry VIII's religious revolution, Mary I's counter-reformation, and Elizabeth I's strategic ambiguity, each monarch sought to respond to the same fundamental problem: the dynasty's questionable hereditary right to rule. Each monarch of the Tudors' 118-year rule felt the persistent nature of legitimacy challenges. Despite their immense contributions to English governance, religion, and culture, the question remained a constant and defining factor of the rulers' reigns. The Tudors reshaped England, but their inability to resolve the deeper legitimacy crises they inherited led to the dynasty's swift conclusion. Their century of rule left behind a powerful monarchy, yet one that had been repeatedly shaken by the very forces that first placed them on the throne.

Bibliography

History Matters. "Ten Minute English and British History #16 - The Wars of the Roses." *YouTube Video*, 9:59. Posted March 20, 2018. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uNcBrrMoyL8>.

Bindoff, S. T. *Tudor England*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1950. Prologue: 1485. <https://archive.org/details/tudorengland0000bind>.

TudorHistory.org. "Henry VII." Last updated February 5, 2012. Accessed May 1, 2025. <https://tudorhistory.org/henry7/>.

Morrill, John S., and Geoffrey R. Elton. "Henry VII, King of England." *Britannica*. Last modified February 14, 2025. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Henry-VIII-king-of-England>.

PBS. "Inside the Court of Henry VIII." Last modified 2015. <https://cptv.pbslearningmedia.org/resource/77dfe726-cbd7-490a-a1d3-a03079c72315/inside-the-court-of-henry-viii/>.

Vergil, Polydore. *The Anglica Historia*. Translated by Dana F. Sutton, 1485–1537. <https://tudorhistory.org/primary/description.html>.

British History Online. *Calendar of State Papers and Manuscripts in the Archives and Collections of Milan 1385-1618*. Accessed February 22, 2025. <https://www.british-history.ac.uk/cal-state-papers/milan/1385-1618>.

Trueman, C. N. "Henry VIII and Government." *History Learning Site*. Last modified March 16, 2015. Accessed March 3, 2025. <https://www.historylearningsite.co.uk/tudor-england/henry-viii-and-government/>.

Morrill, John S. "Edward VI, King of England and Ireland." *Britannica*. Last Updated March 7, 2025. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Edward-VI>.

Hanson, Marilee. "Marian Government Policies – Queen Mary I / Mary Tudor." *English History*. February 9, 2015. <https://englishhistory.net/tudor/monarchs/marian-government-policies/>.

Simons, Eric Norman. "Mary I, Queen of England." *Britannica*. Last modified February 14, 2025. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Mary-I>.

Anonymous Bystander. "Archbishop Thomas Cranmer Death by Execution." March 21, 1556. <https://englishhistory.net/tudor/thomas-cranmer-death/>.

Real Royalty. "The Forgotten Tudor Queen: Bloody Mary." *YouTube Video*. November 8, 2019. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D-ib-hqYjXM&t=3s&ab_channel=RealRoyalty>.

Greenblatt, Stephen J., and John S. Morrill. "Elizabeth I, Queen of England." *Britannica*. Last Updated April 9, 2025. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Elizabeth-I>.

Tudor Times. "Elizabeth I: Life Story (Gloriana)." Published September 21, 2021. <https://tudortimes.co.uk/people/elizabeth-i-life-story/gloriana>.

Biography.com. "Queen Elizabeth I." Updated February 7, 2020. <https://www.biography.com/royalty/queen-elizabeth-i>.

1. History Matters. "Ten Minute English and British History #16 - The Wars of the Roses." *YouTube Video*, 9:59. Posted March 20, 2018. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uNcBrrMoyL8>. [↑](#footnote-ref-12343)
2. Bindoff, S. T. *Tudor England*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1950. Prologue: 1485. <https://archive.org/details/tudorengland0000bind>. [↑](#footnote-ref-28209)
3. TudorHistory.org. "Henry VII." Last updated February 5, 2012. Accessed May 1, 2025. <https://tudorhistory.org/henry7/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-11469)
4. Morrill, John S., and Geoffrey R. Elton. "Henry VII, King of England." *Britannica*. Last modified February 14, 2025. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Henry-VIII-king-of-England>. [↑](#footnote-ref-900)
5. PBS. "Inside the Court of Henry VIII." Last modified 2015. <https://cptv.pbslearningmedia.org/resource/77dfe726-cbd7-490a-a1d3-a03079c72315/inside-the-court-of-henry-viii/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-26101)
6. Vergil, Polydore. *The Anglica Historia*. Translated by Dana F. Sutton, 1485–1537. <https://tudorhistory.org/primary/description.html>. [↑](#footnote-ref-82)
7. British History Online. *Calendar of State Papers and Manuscripts in the Archives and Collections of Milan 1385-1618*. Accessed February 22, 2025. <https://www.british-history.ac.uk/cal-state-papers/milan/1385-1618>. [↑](#footnote-ref-30428)
8. Trueman, C. N. "Henry VIII and Government." *History Learning Site*. Last modified March 16, 2015. Accessed March 3, 2025. <https://www.historylearningsite.co.uk/tudor-england/henry-viii-and-government/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-12705)
9. Morrill, John S. "Edward VI, King of England and Ireland." *Britannica*. Last Updated March 7, 2025. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Edward-VI>. [↑](#footnote-ref-8829)
10. Hanson, Marilee. "Marian Government Policies – Queen Mary I / Mary Tudor." *English History*. February 9, 2015. <https://englishhistory.net/tudor/monarchs/marian-government-policies/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-2182)
11. Simons, Eric Norman. "Mary I, Queen of England." *Britannica*. Last modified February 14, 2025. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Mary-I>. [↑](#footnote-ref-23370)
12. Anonymous Bystander. "Archbishop Thomas Cranmer Death by Execution." March 21, 1556. <https://englishhistory.net/tudor/thomas-cranmer-death/>. [↑](#footnote-ref-23609)
13. Real Royalty. "The Forgotten Tudor Queen: Bloody Mary." *YouTube Video*. November 8, 2019. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D-ib-hqYjXM&t=3s&ab_channel=RealRoyalty>. [↑](#footnote-ref-10426)
14. Greenblatt, Stephen J., and John S. Morrill. "Elizabeth I, Queen of England." *Britannica*. Last Updated April 9, 2025. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Elizabeth-I>. [↑](#footnote-ref-26312)
15. Tudor Times. "Elizabeth I: Life Story (Gloriana)." Published September 21, 2021. <https://tudortimes.co.uk/people/elizabeth-i-life-story/gloriana>. [↑](#footnote-ref-26352)
16. Biography.com. "Queen Elizabeth I." Updated February 7, 2020. <https://www.biography.com/royalty/queen-elizabeth-i>.. [↑](#footnote-ref-11054)